

# Reentry of Released Female Prisoners into the Community

Efodi Rotem and Adamchuk Irit\*

*Department of Criminology, Ashkelon Academic College, Israel*

**Abstract:** The literature shows a strong connection between lack of employment and involvement in crime, while finding employment represents a turning point in the life of the offender. This study examined the reentry to society of 126 female Israeli prisoners who participated in the Rehabilitation-Vocational Program, most of them were on parole, and others after release. It focused on the women's search for work, their "employment preparedness", and their stability in the workplace. Despite the multi-problem nature of the released female population, the results indicate a relatively high success rate of stability in the workplace. The study indicates that employment was found after approximately two months. This interval from time of release to time of employment is consistent with the assumption that the former prisoners need a period of treatment and adjustment before entry in the workforce. The Rehabilitation-Vocational Program utilizes volunteers from the community and develops programs based on mentors who are positive role models. The findings indicate that such a model assists the former female prisoners in successfully reintegrating with the community.

**Keywords:** Released prisoners, female offenders, reentry, employment, rehabilitation.

## INTRODUCTION

During 2015, 12,500 criminal offenders were incarcerated in the Israeli correction system. Of these, only 120 were women (1.7%) all of whom were imprisoned in the single Israeli prison for women, Neve Tirza (Israel Prison Service, 2016).

Empirical literature dealing with released prisoners shows meaningful and substantial differences between male and female prisoners. In particular, more female prisoners suffer from mental illness than do male prisoners (Fazel and Danesh 2002; Andrews, Bonta and Wormith, 2006). Women are also more likely to be addicted to psychoactive substances. Upon their release from prison, many women lack family support and often have to take care of small children. Researchers conclude that rehabilitation programs for released prisoners should be adapted to the specific needs of women, taking into account both their mental and physical health, family intricacies and their role as mothers - often as single mothers of small children (Chapman 1980; Richie 2001).

One of the most important stages in rehabilitating prisoners, both during incarceration and after release, is integration in employment (Davidsko and Volk 2011). Integration in legitimate work allows the released prisoners to make a living (Saylor and Gaes 2007) and may neutralize, or at least reduce, their motivation to participate in crime (Bloom, 2006; Bouffard, MacKenzie and Hickman 2000). Researchers also noted that

employment increases self-esteem, provides a social network, develops a positive sense of belonging to the community, promotes a daily normative routine (Visher, Winterfield and Coggeshall 2005; Western, Kling and Weiman 2001; Wilson *et al.* 2000), and serves as an informal mechanism for controlling behavior (Uggen and Staff 2001; Visher, Winterfield and Coggeshall 2005; Wilson *et al.* 2000).

Since employment provides the former prisoners with a daily schedule, it helps prevent idleness and inactivity. Moreover, employment involves the former prisoner in normative surrounding and helps him acquire new behavioral traits (Duwen 2015). For these reasons, many believe that integration into employment is the most vital component to the success of rehabilitation. Despite the above, however, many former prisoners have difficulty in finding employment (Bialer and Peled-Laskov 2011). Studies have shown numerous obstacles that impede the integration of offenders in the labor market after release from prison (MacKenzie 2008; Newton *et al.* 2016). A significant obstacle is that prisoners' level of education is typically lower than that of the general population (MacKenzie 2008; Tolber 2012). In particular, there is a significant gap in the level of reading skills among the prison population compared to the general population of the (Greenberg, Dunleavy and Kutner, 2007). Beyond the educational gap, many studies suggest that the prison population tends to be characterized by a lack of vocational skills (Lawrence, Mears, Dubin and Travis, 2002; Petersilia 2003; Western, Kling and Weiman, 2001), a lack of work experience (Bloom 2006; Lawrence *et al.* 2002), an unstable employment history (Petersilia 2003; National Institute of Justice 2015; Visher, Winterfield, and Coggeshall 2005), and a lack

\*Address correspondence to this author at the Department of Criminology, Ashkelon Academic College, Israel; Tel: 08-6789111; Fax: 08-6789169; E-mail: iryn4ik@gmail.com, rotem-a@pra.gov.il

of knowledge and appropriate skills to join the workforce (Visher *et al.* 2005). As a result, it is not surprising that released prisoners find it difficult to enter the labor market or to maintain stable employment after their release from prison (Bloom 2006; Newton *et al.* 2016; Visher, Winterfield and Coggeshall 2005).

Various researchers claim that alongside the complicated issue of having to deal with the world of employment, it is even more complex and difficult for released female prisoners than it is for male inmates. Female ex-convicts' difficulties in integrating into the workforce are intensified and exasperated by low level of education, lack of satisfying work experience, the ex-convicts' emotional and personal circumstances, and by the high percentage of substance addictions and mental illness among them (Chen and Gueta 2015; Collins and Collins 1996; Steffensmier and Allan 1996; Teplin, Abram and McClelland 1996).

Due to the small number of female prisoners in Israeli jails and worldwide there have been a relatively small number of studies on rehabilitation of released female prisoners. Moreover, studies pertaining to female Israeli prisoners and to their rehabilitation have been based mostly on qualitative research through in-depth interviews (Ajzenstadt, Sofer and Steinberg 2010; Chen and Einat 2010). It would appear that this field research both in Israel and throughout the world lacks empirical studies that can shed light on various perspectives of female prisoner rehabilitation and, thereby, aid decision and policy makers in the field.

This study evaluated all of the released female prisoners treated in the TELEM - Vocational Rehabilitation Center in Israel over a period of 18 months, between January 2014 and June 2015, and examined the effectiveness of the treatment.

The purpose of the study was to examine the "employability" of the women in treatment, and to identify the occupational profiles of the released female prisoners being treated at the center: the extent of their integration in the workplace, amount of time until the beginning of employment and stability in the place of work.

The results will help the professionals to review activities in this unique field and to design their rehabilitation programs on evidence-based policies (For a description of evidence-based policies in the law enforcement system, see: Lipsey, Petrie, Weisburd and Gottfredson 2006).

## **Rehabilitation Programs for Released Female Prisoners**

In recent years, there has been an escalation in women's criminal activities and a growing awareness of female delinquency (Bloom, Owen and Covington, 2003; Home Office 2007). As a result, there has been an increased interest in women involved in criminal activity. Factors such as ethnicity, socio-economic status, education, drug abuse and age were found to be risk factors that may characterize prisoners in general and women in particular. Female prisoners are generally young and poor. Most of them are single mothers with children under 18 (Richie 2001). It was found that a large percentage of female prisoners is characterized by a background of sexual abuse and exploitation as well as drug and alcohol abuse (Greenfeld and Snell 1999; Krischer and Sevecke 2008).

Studies have found that women prisoners usually have histories of financial and social deprivation (Bloom, Owen, and Covington 2003; Severson, Berry and Postmus 2007). For example, Severson *et al.* (2007) found that female prisoners in the United States are typically less educated than other women, became pregnant at a young age and had received financial assistance from the state. They also reported higher levels of violence against them, a higher use of drugs and alcohol and absence of social support. The same problems continue after their release from prison. Moreover, since they are usually released from prison without economic and social support, most female released prisoners are likely to return to prison after a short time (Urbina 2008).

When women are released from prison, they are confused and anxious about their fates. Urbina (2008) found that a significant portion of the inmates (39.0%) did not know where they were going to live or with whom. Nor did they know who would help and support them after release from incarceration. These studies imply that without significant relationships created between prisoners and the community while the women were still incarcerated, there was a high probability for recidivism and re-incarceration. Therefore, programs based on integration in the community are an important component in creating a continuity of care between the prison and the community and in helping reduce recidivism.

An examination of reintegration programs for both male and female offenders shows two main

approaches. One approach is to assess the risk factors unique to the offender and then create a suitable intervention program based on those factors. The approach is based on the risk-needs-responsibility (RNR) model developed by Andrews, Bonta, and Hogue (1990) which includes an overall assessment of risk, need, and responsibility. Advocates of this approach argue that most of the risk factors leading to criminal behavior are similar for both women and men.

The second approach deals with gender-specific effects on the individual's behavior in general, and on criminal behavior in specific. This approach stresses that intervention and rehabilitation programs must be gender-specific. Studies focused on building rehabilitation programs for female offenders indicate that such issues as separation from the family, social isolation, poor living conditions, and lack of stable employment must be considered (Blitz 2006; Dodge and Pogrebin 2001; Shinkfield and Graffam 2009).

Advocates of this approach (Blanchette and Brown 2006; Blanchette and Taylor 2009) argue that therapeutic intervention for female prisoners is particularly complex due to both the patriarchal structure of prisons and law enforcement systems and the offenders' personal histories of abuse and various psychological problems. Hence, traditional treatment based on a universal gender-neutral rehabilitation approach usually fails with female offenders. They conclude that a treatment based on intervention according to the patient's strong points is more appropriate for treating female offenders (Blanchette and Taylor, 2009). This approach has led, among other things, to the development of a separate branch of psychology named "Positive Psychology".

Positive psychology is defined as an approach that emphasizes positive emotions and positive personality traits (Seligman, Steen, Park, and Peterson 2005). According to Blanchette and Taylor (2009), a successful rehabilitation program that promotes female offenders' integration in the community must involve three factors: a gendered pathways understanding; a recognition that healthy interpersonal relationships are critical to the success of treatment among women offenders; and using a combination of the strengths-based approach and the positive psychology approach. The Strengths-Based Perspective suggests that offenders' strengths should be taken into consideration during their integration into treatment. Service providers and therapists must emphasize the offender's

strong points to help him recover and become reintegrated in the community (Van Wormer 2001).

Various studies (Brown 2010; Cobbina 2010; Wright, DeHart, Koons-Witt and Crittenden 2013) have also stressed the importance of social relationships between women and the connection between those relationships to criminal behavior or continued involvement in crime. The most significant relationships among women were mother-child relationships and those concerning parental responsibility. These studies (Brown, 2010; Cobbina 2010; Wright, DeHart, Koons-Witt, and Crittenden 2013) have found that services assisting with childcare, sense of security, the development of parenting skills and support thereof are key variables in the success of female offenders' reintegration.

### **The Research Framework – Employment Center for Released Female Prisoners (TELEM)**

TELEM was established to serve as an employment center for released female offenders. Its goal is to provide these women with therapeutic training and occupational response before their integration in the workplace. In addition, TELEM assists former prisoners who have been unable to remain employed (Timmer, Sinbani and Sarig 2002). The center also provides support and assistance during afternoon and evening hours for women who are already employed.

The center's *modus operandi* has changed several times over the years to adapt to the changing needs of released prisoners. One factor that triggered such changes was the dramatic increase in the number of female prisoners sentenced for traffic offenses and fraud (Israel Prison Service 2016). TELEM defines its current target population for treatment as female ex-prisoners living in central Israel and women living in a nearby hostel (Israeli Prisoners Rehabilitation Authority - IPRA 2016). Except in extremely exceptional cases, any released prisoner who is interested in rehabilitation is accepted to the center, Drug users are sent for detoxification either before being accepted or during treatment.

The rehabilitation center provides holistic treatment. All activities are trauma-therapy oriented and include individual treatment for each woman according to her personal needs and characteristics. The center places every woman who wants to work in a suitable workplace. Because traditional "female" jobs (domestic and kitchen help) are not sufficiently financially

rewarding, TELEM attempts to break the "glass ceiling" that limits women to jobs deemed suitable for women. (IPRA 2016).

The center's activities are divided between the day and evening. The women treated during the daytime sessions attend daily from 8.30 a.m. – 3.30 p.m. The schedule is intended to give a sense of a normal working day to women who have not worked and lack organized, structured days. The evening activities include individual and group mental health care; occupational guidance and supervision; and community service activities (volunteer work). The evening activities are aimed at women who function normally, have normal work habits and who do not need preparation for employment. The evening program is also for women who have completed the day-center stage and who are integrated in the work force but need further care, guidance and supervision.

The center's activities are varied. They include vocational and employment rehabilitation; individual and group psychotherapy; enrichment classes and leisure activities; and emergency aid and guidance in times of crisis. The staff comprises strictly female rehabilitation counselors and an employment coordinator, as well as volunteer students who gain practical training working under the director and social workers.

## **Method**

### **Participants**

The study population comprised all the female ex-prisoners who received treatment in the TELEM rehabilitation center between January 2014 and June 2015 (18 months). It included those subjects who dropped out during treatment. Fifty percent of the subjects began treatment immediately upon release from prison. The remaining fifty percent began within a month and a half of release. All the women had been released in the two years preceding the study. All of them had been incarcerated in the Neve Tirza jail as this is the only women's prison in Israel. The average age of participants was 40.89 (SD = 11.78).

Most women (80%) received early release from the parole board with participation in the TELEM program being one of the conditions for release. Twenty percent of the subjects were released from prison unconditionally (full release without a shortened sentence); these women attended TELEM voluntarily.

A total of 126 women participated in treatments at the center during the research period.

Table 1 shows that approximately 90% of the program participants in the TELEM care center during the research period were Jewish as opposed to 9.5% who were Arab. The majority were born in Israel (57.1%) while approximately a quarter were born in the former Soviet Union. Most of the participants were not in a relationship: 45.2% were single and 38% were separated from their husbands. Only 16% of the women were married. The average age of the women was relatively high: 40 years of age (SD = 11.85). 44 women had no children. The average number of children per woman was 1.54 (SD = 1.59).

The therapists who completed the questionnaires assessed the economic circumstances of women treated at TELEM as relatively low. Only about 23% of the subjects were evaluated as having sufficient income to live under suitable conditions and fulfill their own needs. The financial circumstances of 55.5% of the subjects was assessed as moderate. 21.5% of them were assessed as a low or needy economic status.

Most of the participants had been incarcerated once (76.2%); 11.9% were after their second release; and a similar percentage had served three or more sentences. Approximately half of the women had served sentences of up to one year; 31% had served sentences of between one and two years; and the rest had served long prison sentences of three or more years. Approximately a quarter of the women had been incarcerated for fraud and 20% for property crimes. The remainder had served for traffic offenses, violence, and drugs. When the crimes were grouped, it was found that most of the participants had served for offenses relating to property, drugs and public disorder (34.9%). After these came violence (including life endangering crimes and robbery), fraud, and transport offenses (in that order).

About half of the women had a history of addiction (drugs or alcohol). It is worth noting that while for most of the subjects (79.4%) treatment was one of the terms for release, the remaining 20% participated voluntarily without any legal obligation. About half of the women treated at TELEM lived in the hostel for released female prisoners. Therefore, these women were treated at the center during the day and continued their therapy in the hostel during the afternoon and evening hours. Half of the women lived independently in the

**Table 1: Socio-Demographic and Legal Characteristics of the Released Prisoners in the TELEM Rehabilitation Program in Percentages (N = 126)**

	%		%
<b>Nationality</b>		<b>Early Release (Parole)</b>	
Jewish	90.5	Yes	79.4
Arab	9.5	No	19.8
<b>Country of Birth</b>		<b>History of Addictions</b>	
Israel	57.1	Yes	44.4
Former USSR	26.2	No	55.6
Ethiopia/Other	16		
<b>Familial Status</b>		<b>Number of Incarcerations</b>	
Unmarried	45.2	One	76.2
Separated	38	Two	11.9
Married	16	Three or more	11.9
Widowed	0.8		
<b>Financial Status</b>		<b>Length of Last Imprisonment</b>	
Low	21.5	Up to a year	52.4
Moderate	55.5	1-3 years	31
High	23	3 years or more	14.3
<b>Age (average)</b>		<b>Main Offenses (grouped)</b>	
40 (SD=11.85)		Violence	28.6
<b>Number of Children (average)</b>		Public order, property and drugs	34.9
1.54 (SD=1.59)		Fraud	22.2
		Traffic	13.5

community after their release from prison, either on their own or with their families.

**Research Tools**

Data was collected through a CRI questionnaire (Characteristics of Released Inmates, Weisburd, Shoham, Barak, Manzfiezer and Gidon, 2005), based on the Prisoner Rehabilitation Authority files of female ex-prisoners. The questionnaire was adapted to the unique characteristics of women. To this end, the researchers used the knowledge and experience of professionals from the IPRA in the field of rehabilitating released female prisoners. The research questionnaire includes five sections:

- a. The subject's socio-demographic characteristics as assessed by TELEM therapists: age, nationality, country of birth, marital status, number of children, place of residence, and financial circumstances.
- b. The subject's criminal status: type of offense that lead to the last incarceration, length of sentence, the number of past incarcerations, dates of entry into prison and release, and whether she was eligible for early release. This category included

the offender's addiction background (drugs or alcohol).

- c. The subject's preparedness to integrate into the work force: number of years of education, level of Hebrew language skills, literacy, professional or vocational certification, job tenure before incarceration, and the employment coordinator's impression of her ability to integrate in the workplace immediately upon release.
- d. The subject's therapeutic and rehabilitation process: treatment and rehabilitation methods used; place of residence during treatment—whether in her own home or in the hostel for released female prisoners; program attended—day or evening program; additional activities while undergoing treatment—volunteer activities, studies, or took vocational training.
- e. Measures of Success: success in finding a job; consistency in the workplace; frequency in which jobs were changed taking into consideration that not all employment placements are appropriate so there may be instability in the workplace; and the reasons for leaving the rehabilitation center—whether the treatment lasted its full term or not.

The IPRA (Israeli Prisoners Rehabilitation Authority) case files are not computerized therefore, the questionnaires were filled out manually. All files of ex-prisoners treated at TELEM are archived, enabling full access. The questionnaires were filled systematically by TELEM's employment coordinator who is an integral part of the treatment and rehabilitation team and is well acquainted with all the subjects.

For the purposes of this study, each subject was assigned a score at the end of her treatment. A patient's score was based on the reports in her file and, in most cases, the evaluator's personal acquaintance with the patient. Therapists were asked to rate the completed treatment's success on a scale of one to five (1 = low success – 5 = high success). Completed treatment was considered successful (5) when the therapist determined that woman was successfully integrated in a workplace, was free from drugs and alcohol use, and was functioning independently and normatively in most areas of life. A score for partially successful treatment (3–4) was assigned when the patient was, despite fluctuations in her condition, able to function and complete treatment satisfactorily, if not fully (e.g. did not use drugs or alcohol during the treatment). Treatment was considered unsuccessful (1–2) when the subject was still unable to maintain employment or when she was still using drugs or alcohol.

## **Findings**

### ***Preparedness for Employment***

Characteristics of employment preparedness included: Professional certification, tenure in previous employment, years of education, preparedness for employment when released from prison (impressionable variable) and fluency in Hebrew language (impressionable variable).

The variables were selected based on the professional experience of IPRA staff who deal with rehabilitation of released female offenders. The average number of years of education of female offenders in Israel was found to be 11.54 (SD = 2.50). For this study the researchers assumed education was often obtained in various correctional settings such as prison rather than within the framework of traditional schooling. Only about half of the women were defined as fluent in Hebrew. Here fluency is determined by ability to speak, write, and read Hebrew. Women in the remaining half were classed as having medium or low control of the language. Thirty-five percent of the ex-

prisoners had no work or vocational experience prior to their incarceration. Furthermore, only 20% of women had professional certification.

The therapists' professional evaluation of the offenders' readiness for vocational integration immediately upon release from prison indicated that approximately one-third (31%) of the women were not ready for employment and only 7.2% of women were suitable at a high level. The remaining subjects were classified as being at moderate adjustment levels.

### **Success Measures during Rehabilitation**

Seventy-seven percent of TELEM's patients during the research period succeeded in finding employment, while 23% were not integrated in employment for various reasons. Among those whose integration in the workforce was successful, 87.5% needed one or two placements during the treatment period. Only 12.5% of the women needed three or more job placements. Moreover, approximately 75.5% of the patients completed their treatment at the designated time thus indicating their parole was not rescinded nor were they otherwise incompatible for the treatment. Stability in employment was defined as a dichotomous variable: whether an employed subject had a single placement more than one placement. This definition was due to the need for future analyses and the relatively small number of participants. While 59.4% of the released women prisoners remained in their first place of employment, 40.6% needed two or more placements. Therapists were asked to assess the degree of the treatment's success for every participant. As noted, this was an impression evaluation. It included the weighting of many variables such as detoxification, stability in the workplace, stability in therapy, and zero recidivism. Fifty-five percent of the ex-convicts who had been at the center during this period were described as having completed treatment extremely successfully, while the rest scored medium to low success rates.

### ***The Correlation between Employment Preparedness and Success Measures***

As described before, the impression score was based on a qualitative weighting of the different variables that are, according to the literature, fundamental parameters of "employment preparedness." Despite the fact that the rehabilitation center has no control over these variables, this research sought to determine to what extent there is a correlation between employment readiness and the success score as defined for this study. To this end, a

Mann-Whitney test was used to find the relationship between employment preparedness and success measures. As expected, the women who successfully integrated in the work place had a higher employment preparedness score (median = 3) than those who had not joined the work force (median = 1)  $U = 632.50$ ,  $n_1 = 29$ ,  $n_2 = 97$ ,  $p < .001$ ,

Moreover, ex-prisoners who were subjectively classified as successfully concluding the treatment had a higher employment preparedness score (median = 3) than those classed as "low" by therapists (median = 1)  $U = 497.50$ ,  $n_1 = 51$ ,  $n_2 = 70$ ,  $p < .001$ . However, no correlation was found between employment preparedness and job stability  $U = 494.50$ ,  $n_1 = 12$ ,  $n_2 = 84$ ,  $p > .05$ .

### Residency in the Hostel versus Living within the Community

When examining the degree of success in job placement and integration in the workplace, a significant difference was found between the released prisoners who lived in the hostel and those who lived independently within the community ( $\chi^2(1) = 3.90$ ,  $p < .05$ ). Of the women who lived independently ( $N = 68$ ), 83.8% found employment as opposed to 69% of those who lived in the hostel ( $N = 58$ ). Another significant difference was found in integration into the workplace of those with and without substance addictions ( $\chi^2(1) = 9.17$ ,  $p < .01$ ). Most of the non-addicted women managed to fit into a place of employment (87%). On the other hand, only 64% of the subjects with a history of addiction were integrated into the workplace.

However, it is interesting to note that although for hostel residents there was no significant correlation between addiction and successfully finishing the program ( $\chi^2(1) = .53$ ,  $p > .05$ ), a significant correlation was found among those living in the community and their success rates ( $\chi^2(1) = 5.91$ ,  $p > .05$ ). Of the women living in the community, 81% of the non-addicted women completed treatment successfully compared to 44% of the addicted women.

### Job Stability and Length of Supervision

A significant correlation was found between previous employment experience (Tenure at workplace) and finding employment ( $\chi^2(1) = 15.52$ ,  $p < .001$ ). Among the 44 participants in the study who had no previous employment, almost half of them (43%) were unsuccessful in integrating in

the workplace. On the other hand, 82 had previous employment which helped their finding jobs (only 12% were unsuccessful). No significant differences were found between Arab and Jewish women, between the types of offenses, the women's ages, and the number of children.

Since the distribution of sentence length and duration of supervision appear as positive asymmetric skew, a Mann-Whitney test was used to find whether a significant difference exists between the length of imprisonment and the length of supervision among those ex-convicts who could and could not find jobs. A significant difference was found between the two groups regarding the period of supervision (Mann-Whitney  $U = 626.50$ ,  $n_1 = 26$ ,  $n_2 = 97$ ,  $p < .001$ ).

The supervision period was found to have been longer among those who found work, median = 7.45 months (range .20 to 51.40.), compared with the released prisoners who were unable to find employment, median = 2.80 months (range .03 to 14.10). Accordingly, there was a significant difference in the distribution of length of incarceration between those could and could not find employment (Mann-Whitney  $U = 937.00$ ,  $n_1 = 26$ ,  $n_2 = 97$ ,  $p < .05$ ). Among the ex-prisoners who found work, incarceration was longer than the median - 13 months (range 0 to 240.00), compared to the group who had not found employment and had served a median of 8.50 (range 3.00 to 31.00) months.

A logistic analysis regression examined the correlation between the various chance factors and the three success measures (finding employment, job stability and successful completion of the program). Chance factors listed in the analysis were based on the relevant literature. To this end, the degree of stability in the workplace was defined as: 1 - one job placement and 0 - two or more placements), and the therapist's impression of success levels of the released prisoner's therapy: (1-high and 0 - medium or low).

An analysis of the first model (logistic regression results of the risk factors) shows that older offenders are less likely to find work; each extra year of age reduces the chances of finding employment by 9%. It was also found that addiction to drugs or alcohol reduces the chances to find work by 97% compared to released prisoners with no history of addiction. This figure may explain the significant differences found between women living in a hostel after release – the majority, having addictions — and those who lived in the community.

**Table 2: Logistic Regression Results of the Risk Factors for the Three Measures of Success: Finding Employment (Model 1), Stability of Employment (Model 2), and Successful Completion of Treatment (Model 3)**

Variable	Model 1 (n = 126) OR (95% CI)	Model 2 (n = 97) OR (95% CI)	Model 3 (n = 126) OR (95% CI)
Age	.91**(0.84, 0.98)	.97 (.93, 1.02)	1.03 (.98,1.09)
Number of children	.94(.58,1.52)	1.18(.84,1.67)	.90(.64,1.28)
Residence (Base – Hostel)	1.20(.10,14.40)	.51(.10,2.62)	1.28(.14,11.78)
Tenure at workplace (Base- no tenure)	7.89 (0.88, 70.58)	.44 (.10, 1.98)	8.82** (1.76, 44.30)
Addiction (Base- none)	.03** (.00, .34)	.72 (0.14, 3.77)	.49 (0.08, 3.23)
Number of Incarcerations (Base- one incarceration)			
Second Incarceration	1.73 (0.25, 3.12)	0.80 (0.12, 5.42)	.03 ** (.002, .38)
Three or more Incarcerations	.20 (.01, 3.09)	.06 * (.01, .57.)	.17 (.02, 1.41)
Length of imprisonment	1.02 (.94, 1.10)	.97* (0.94, .99)	1.07 (.99, 1.16)
Main Offense (Base- Violence)			
Public Order- Property-Drugs	1.77 (.16, 19.51)	4.96 (.96, 25.71)	2.44 (0.37, 15.90)
Fraud	0.04 * (0.002, 0.95)	2.42 (.57, 10.27)	2.95 (0.55, 15.97)
Traffic	0.29 (0.01, 8.13)	1.60 (.31, 8.23)	10.26 * (1.26, 83.23)
Supervision Period	1.47** (1.13, 1.92)	0.99 (.99, 1.00)	1.12 * (1.01, 1.23)
-2LL	56.17	94.60	74.34
$\chi^2(12)$	** 60.24	** 33.28	** 78.38
NagelkerkeR2	.64.	.40	.68.
Classification accuracy	88.1%	73.7%	88.5%

p <.05, \*\* p <.01 \* -OR (odds ratio).

Each extra month of supervision increased the chances of finding work by 47%, and an effect close to significant was found for job tenure ( $p = 0.065$ ). Thus, ex-prisoners with tenure in past employment were 7.89 times more likely to find work. It was also found that prisoners charged with fraud were less likely to be integrated into the work force than those whose main offense was violence. No difference was found between released prisoners whose main offenses were public disorder, fraud, drugs, and violence and traffic offenses. No significant effect was found regarding the number of sentences, length of incarceration, place of residence or number of children.

Regarding stability in employment (Model 2), the logistic regression analysis found that employment stability among prisoners with three or more sentences was lower by 94% compared to those after one incarceration. It also found that the longer the incarceration, the lower the chances of job stability, and that an additional year in prison reduced the chances for stability by 3%. Age, number of children, place of residence, and length of employment, addiction, crime,

and length of supervision did not have any significant effect on employment stability.

Analysis of the logistic regression of the chance of the success of treatment among released prisoners (Model 3) shows that work experience contributes significantly to the successfully completed treatment. Those released prisoners with experience in the workplace are 8.82 times more likely to successfully complete treatment, and each subsequent month of supervision increases the chances of a successful conclusion by 12%. Moreover, a prisoner with two incarcerations will be 97% less successful in concluding treatment than those who have served one sentence, while those who were tried for traffic offenses were 10.3 times more likely to successfully complete the program than those who had served for violence.

## DISCUSSION

The goal of this study was to examine the short term efficacy of TELEM's treatment program among released prisoners females. The findings indicate a

relatively high success rate in the reintegration of released female offenders in employment and their work stability as well as relatively low rates of recidivism during parole. These positive findings are noteworthy, mainly due to the difficult socio-legal backgrounds of the women, which include relatively advanced ages and their role as mothers of small children, high addiction rates and the lack of extensive work experience (Bloom 2006; Greenberg, Dunleavy, and Kutner, 2007; Lawrence *et al.* 2002; Visher, Winterfield, and Coggeshall 2005). Their achievements in rehabilitation were relatively high, despite difficult starting conditions. Most of the women treated in TELEM during the research period succeeded in integrating in the workforce (77%). Approximately two-thirds managed to remain employed after only one or two placements. Moreover, only 18.3% dropped out of rehabilitation during the research period. These women left the program because of incompatibility or because their parole was rescinded. This dropout rate is remarkably lower than the 43% rate observed when the TELEM center was established (Timmer, Sinbani, and Sarig 2002). The findings showed that the median time to find employment was approximately two months. This finding is consistent with the professional assumption that most women need a period of treatment and adjustment after their release from prison and before entering the workforce.

Numerous studies conducted among female prisoners found a clear link between victimization during childhood and crime among women (Ben David, Alik, and Silfan, 2002; Gur, 2004). Thus, policy must take into consideration that female delinquency is a result of prolonged hardship and victimization, therefore a significant "recovery" period is essential before a woman is able to function in the normative world. It can be seen that TELEM rehabilitation center's holistic framework affords a period of "convalescence" and rehabilitation after incarceration. During this time, the women receive mental health care and acquire occupational skills before being integrated into the work world. TELEM's holistic therapy may explain the relatively high success rate of released female prisoners in employment and their stability therein. However, this study is unable to assess their continued stability in the workplace after leaving the center nor the level of recidivism after leaving.

Programs based on community integration are a central element providing continuity of care during period between release from prison and integration in

the community. Moreover, such programs help prevent recidivism. Examining the existing treatment models for released female offenders (e.g. Dowden and Andrews 1999) indicates that TELEM's operating model is consistent with the professional approach that recommends using female volunteers from the community and developing programs utilizing mentors who are positive role models and who help make connections with the community (Hamilton *et al.* 2006; Roberti Silvia and Walsh 1996, in Salgado, Fox and Quinlan 2011). Research knowledge accumulated in the field of rehabilitation of released prisoners (e.g. Cavanagh, Daly and Flaherty 2007; Easton and Matthews, 2010;) suggests that to maximize the care and assistance provided to released female offenders, treatment centers must be as holistic as possible with all services under one roof (Cavanagh, Daly and Flaherty 2007). Such treatment centers provide increased access to treatment for women with complex needs, with young children and low income. In doing so they motivate participation in the services offered.

Evaluation studies implicated that to achieve maximum efficiency in reducing recidivism among ex-prisoners, rehabilitation programs must find, *inter alia*, vocational training solutions (McKean and Ransford 2004). The present research shows that only 18% of the released female prisoners participated in training programs after their release from prison. This figure indicates that vocational training is of relatively low importance among Israel's policy makers in the field of rehabilitation of former prisoners. It appears that the chances released prisoners have for rehabilitation and optimal integration in employment is negatively impacted by the relatively high level of unemployment among Israeli women and by the difficulties women generally have in integrating into the workforce.

Even though the number of female prisoners in Israel is relatively small and the current research focused only on the short-term objectives of the TELEM Center, the study's positive findings suggest that policymakers should develop holistic services. This services must include a differential program targeting the criminogenic needs and characteristics of female offenders including the nature of their offenses and the woman's addiction patterns. It also appears that more emphasis should be placed on vocational training services which may help the offenders integrate in the work world after release from the center and may help contribute to improve their senses of self-worth and self-efficacy.

## REFERENCES

- Ajzenstadt, Mimi, Sofer, Michal, and Steinberg, Odeda. 2010. Bakele Ani Nakha: Asirof Mibad Lakhomot [In Jail, I Rest: Female Prisoners From Behind the Walls]. Bnei Brak: Hakibbutz Haemeuchad.
- Andrews, Donald A., Bonta, James, and Hoge, Robert D. 1990. "Classification for Effective Rehabilitation: Rediscovering Psychology". *Criminal Justice and Behavior* 17:19-52. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0093854890017001004>
- Andrews, Donald A., Bonta, James, and Wormith, J Steve. 2006. "The Recent Past and Near Future of Risk/Need Assessment". *Crime and Delinquency* 52: 7-27. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0011128705281756>
- Ben David, Sara, Alik, Malka, and Silfan, Peter. 2002. "Asirof Beyisrael, Trauma U'peshia [Women Prisoners in Israel: Trauma and Crime], In *Avaryanut Vestiya Chevratit* [Delinquency and Social Deviation] edited by Moshe Adar & Yuval Wolf . Ramat Gan: Bar-Ilan University Press.
- Bialer, Gidon, and Peled-Laskov, Ronit (2011). "*Pikuakh Vetaasuka – Trumatam Shel Hapikuakh Vehataasuka Leshikumam Shel Asirim Meshukhrarim beYisrael*" [Supervision and Employment – The Contribution of Supervision and Employment to the Rehabilitation of Released Prisoners in Israel]. *Tzohar Lebeit Hasohar* 14: 112-130.
- Blanchette, Kelley, and Taylor, Kelly N. 2009. "Reintegration of Female Offenders: Perspectives on What Works". *Corrections Today* 71: 60-63.
- Blanchette, Kelley and Shelley Lynn, Brown. 2006. *The Assessment and Treatment of Women Offenders: An Integrative Perspective*. New Jersey, NY: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Blitz, Cindy L. 2006. "Predictors of Stable Employment among Female Inmates in New Jersey: Implications for Successful Reintegration". *Journal of Offender Rehabilitation* 43: 1-22. [https://doi.org/10.1300/J076v43n01\\_01](https://doi.org/10.1300/J076v43n01_01)
- Bloom, Dan. 2006. "Employment-Focused Programs for Ex-Prisoners: What have We Learned, What are We learning, and Where should We Go from here?". *MDRC*
- Bloom, Barbara, Owen, Barbara, and Covington, Stephanie. 2003. *Gender Responsive Strategies for Women Offenders: A Summary of Research, Practice and Guiding Principles for Women Offenders*. Washington, D.C.: National Institute of Corrections.
- Brown, Shelley. 2010. "Female Offenders". In *Psychology of Criminal Behavior: A Canadian Perspective*, edited by Ralph Serin, Adelle Forth, Brown, Shelley Keven Nunes, Craig Bennell, and Joanna Pozzulo (pp. 369-401). Toronto, ON: Pearson Education Canada.
- Bouffard, Jeffrey A., MacKenzie, Doris Layton, and Hickman, Laura J. 2000. "Effectiveness of Vocational Education and Employment Programs for Adult Offenders: A Methodology-Based Analysis of the Literature". *Journal of Offender Rehabilitation* 31: 1-41. [https://doi.org/10.1300/J076v31n01\\_01](https://doi.org/10.1300/J076v31n01_01)
- Cavanagh, B., Daly, M., and Flaherty, A. 2007. *What life After Prison? Voices of Women in Cornton Vale*. Edinburgh: Circle.
- Chapman Jane Roberts. 1980. *Economic Realities and the Female Offender*. Toronto: Lexington Books.
- Chen, Gila, and Einat, Tomer. 2010. "Kele Nashim: Hekhatzer Haakhorit shel Hakhevra HaYisraelit [A Women's Jail: The Back Yard of Israeli Society]". Tel Aviv: Khidekel.
- Chen, Gila, and Gueta, Keren. 2015. "Child Abuse, Drug Addiction and Mental Health Problems of Incarcerated Women in Israel". *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry* 39: 36–45. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijlp.2015.01.019>
- Cobbina, Jennifer E. 2010. "Reintegration Success and Failure: Factors Impacting Reintegration among Incarcerated and Formerly Incarcerated Women". *Journal of Offender Rehabilitation* 49: 1-22. <https://doi.org/10.1080/105909671003666602>
- Collins, William, and Collins, Andrew. 1996. *Women in Jail: Legal Issues*. Washinton, DC: National Institute of Corrections.
- Davidsko, Ido, and Volk, Dror. 2011. *Taasukat Asirim Kikhli Shikumi* [Employment for Prisoners as a Tool for Rehabilitation]. Ramle: The Research Unit of the Prison Service.
- Dodge, Mary, and Pogrebin, Mark R. 2001. "Collateral Costs of Imprisonment for Women: Complication of Reintegration". *The Prison Journal* 81: 42-54. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0032885501081001004>
- Dowden, Craig, and Andrews, Donald A. 1999. *What Works for Female Offenders: A Meta- Analytic Review*. *Crime and Delinquency*, 45: 438-452. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0011128799045004002>
- Duwe, Grant. 2015. "The Benefits of Keeping Idle Hands Busy an Outcome Evaluation of aPrisoner Reentry Employment Program". *Crime and Delinquency* 61: 559-586. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0011128711421653>
- Easton, Helen, and Matthews, Roger. 2010. *Evaluation of the 218 Service: Examining Implementation and Outcomes*. Scottish Government Social Research:Glasgow
- Fazel, Seena, and Danesh, John. (2002). "Serious Mental Disorder in 23,000 Prisoners: A Systematic Review of 62 Surveys". *Lancet*, 359: 545–550. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(02\)07740-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(02)07740-1)
- Greenberg, Elizabeth, Dunleavy, Eric, and Kutner, Mark. 2007. *Literacy Behind Bars: Results from the 2003 National Assessment of Adult Literacy Prison Survey*. NCES 2007 473: National Center for Education Statistics.
- Gur, Anat. 2004. "Hasarsur sheli lo haya tsarikh lelamed oti klum, aba limed [My pimp did not have to teach me anything, my father taught me]". In *Hasod Veshivro: Sugiyot Begilui Arayot* [Shattering the Secret: Issues in Incest] edited by Tzvia Zeligman and Zahava Solomon. Bnei Brak: Hakibbutz Haemeuchad.
- Hamilton, Stephen R., Hamilton, Mary Agnes, Hirsch, Barton J., Hughes, Jan, King, Jacqueline, and Maton, Kenneth. 2006. "Community Contexts for Mentoring". *Journal of Community Psychology* 34: 727-746. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jcop.20126>
- Home Office. 2007. *Sentencing statistics 2005 England and Wales*. London: Home Office.
- Israel Prison Service. 2016. Retrieved September15 from <https://www.gov.il/he/Departments/publications/?skip=0&limit=10>
- Israeli Prisoners Rehabilitation Authority. 2016. Retrieved September 10 from: <http://www.pra.co.il/180409/%D7%A4%D7%A8%D7%A1%D7%95%D7%9E%D7%99%D7%9D%D7%9E%D7%A7%D7%A6%D7%95%D7%A2%D7%99%D7%99%D7%9D>
- Krischer, Maya K., and Sevecke, Kathrin. (2008). "Early Traumatization and Psychopathy in Female and Male Juvenile Offenders". *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry* 31: 253–262. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijlp.2008.04.008>
- Lawrence, Sarah, Mears, Daniel P., Dubin, Glenn, and Travis, Jeremy. 2002. *The practice and promise of prison programming*. Research Report.
- Leonard, Kimberly Kemf, Pope, Carl E., and Feyerherm, William H. eds. 1995. *Eds. Minorities in Juvenile Justice*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publication.
- MacKenzie, Doris Layton. 2008. *Structure and Components of Successful Educational Programs*. Reentry Roundtable on Education. New York: John Jay College of Criminal Justice.
- McKean, Lise, and Ransford, Charles. 2004. *Current Strategies for Reducing Recidivism*. Chicago, IL: Center for Impact Research

- Newton, Danielle, Day, Andrew, Giles, Margaret, Wodak, Joanne, Graffam, Joe, and Baldry, Eileen. 2016. "The Impact of Vocational Education and Training Programs on Recidivism: A Systematic Review of Current Experimental Evidence". *International Journal of Offender Therapy and Comparative Criminology* 13: 1-26.
- National Institute of Justice. (2015). Practice profile: Corrections-Based Vocational Training Programs. National Institute of Justice. Retrieved from <https://www.crimesolutions.gov/PracticeDetails.aspx?ID=24>
- Petersilia, Joan. 2003. *When Prisoners Come Home: Parole and Prisoner Reentry*. New York, N.Y.: Oxford University Press
- Richie, Beth E. 2001. "Challenges Incarcerated Women Face as they Return to their Communities: Findings from Life History Interviews". *Crime and Delinquency* 47: 368-389. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0011128701047003005>
- Salgado Dawn M., Fox Judith B., Quinlan Kristen J. 2011. "Community mentoring in the United States: An evaluation of the Rhode Island Women's Mentoring Program". Pp. 279-297 in *Working with women offenders in the community*, edited by R. Sheehan, G. McIvor and C. Trotter. New York, NY: Willan.
- Salisbury, Emily, and Van Voorhis, Patricia. 2009. "Gendered Pathways: A Quantitative Investigation of Women Probationers' Paths to Incarceration". *Criminal Justice and Behavior* 36: 541-566. <https://doi.org/10.1177/00938548093334076>
- Saylor, William G., and Gaes, Gerald G. 1997. "Training Inmates through Industrial Work Participation and Vocational and Apprenticeship Instruction". *Corrections Management Quarterly* 1: 32-43.
- Seligman, Martin E.P., Steen, Tracy A., Park, Nansook, and Peterson, Christopher. 2005. "Positive Psychology Progress: Empirical Validation of Interventions". *American Psychologist* 60: 410-421. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0003-066X.60.5.410>
- Severson, Margaret, Berry, Marianne, and Postmus, Judy L. 2007. "Risk and Needs: Factors that Predict Women's Incarceration and Inform Service Planning". Pp. 61-90, in *What Works with Women Offenders*, edited by Rosemary Sheehan, Gill McIvor, and Chris Trotter. Cullmcott Devon: Willan Publishing.
- Shinkfield, Alison J., and Graffam, Joseph. 2009. "Community Reintegration of Ex-Prisoners: Type and Degree of Change in Variables Influencing Successful Reintegration". *International Journal of Offender Therapy and Comparative Criminology* 53: 29-42. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0306624X07309757>
- Steffensmier, Darrell, and Allan, Emilie. 1996. "Gender and Crime: Toward a Gendered Theory of Female Offending". *Annual Review of Sociology* 22: 459-487. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.soc.22.1.459>
- Teplin, Linda, Abram, Karen M., and McClelland, Gary M. 1996. Prevalence of Psychiatric Disorders among Incarcerated Women. *Archives of General Psychiatry* 53: 505-512. <https://doi.org/10.1001/archpsyc.1996.01830060047007>
- Timmer, Amnon, Sinbani Arnona, and Sarig, Irit. 2002. "Merkaz Yom Leasirot Meshukhrarot (Khelek A) [A Day Center for Released Female Prisoners (Part 1)]". Jerusalem: The National Insurance Institute, The Research and Planning Administration and Department for Development of Services.
- Uggen, C., and Staff, J. 2001. "Work as a Turning Point for Criminal Offenders". *Corrections Management Quarterly* 5: 1-16.
- Urbina, Martin Guevará. 2008. *A Comprehensive Study of Female Offenders: Life Before, During and after Incarceration*. Springfield, IL: Charles C Thomas Ltd.
- Van Voorhis, Patricia, Wright Emily M., Salisbury, Emily, and Bauman Ashley. 2010. *Women's Risk Factors and Their Contributions to Existing Risk/Needs Assessment The Current Status of a Gender-Responsive Supplement*. *Criminal Justice and Behavior* 37: 261-288. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0093854809357442>
- Visher, Christy A., Winterfield, Laura, and Coggeshall, Mark B. 2005. "Ex-Offender Employment Programs and Recidivism: A Meta-Analysis". *Journal of Experimental Criminology* 1: 295-316. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11292-005-8127-x>
- Weisburd, David, Shoham, Efrat, Barak, Ariel, Manzfiezer, Michelle, and Gidon, Lior, 2005. *Khazara Leavaryanut Bekerev Asirim Meshukhrarim Bogreu Merkaz Hashikim Haartz Bekele Hasharon 1994-1997 [Recidivism Amongst Released Prisoners Graduating the National Center for Rehabilitation at the Sharon Prison 1994-1997]*. Jerusalem: The Israeli Anti-Drug Authority
- Western, Bruce, Kling, Jeffrey R., and Weiman, David F. (2001). "The labor market consequences of incarceration". *Crime and Delinquency* 47: 410-427.
- Wilson, David B., Gallagher, Catherine A., and MacKenzie, Doris L. 2000. A Meta-Analysis of Corrections-Based Education, Vocation, and Work Programs for Adult Offenders. *Journal of Research in Crime & Delinquency* 37: 347-368. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022427800037004001>
- Wright, Emily M., DeHart, Dana D., Koons-Witt, Barbara A., and Crittenden, Courtney A. 2013. "Buffers' against crime? Exploring the roles and limitations of positive relationships among women in prison". *Punishment and Society* 1: 71-95. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1462474512466199>

Received on 25-01-2017

Accepted on 09-02-2017

Published on 17-03-2017

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.6000/1929-4409.2017.06.04>

© 2017 Rotem and Irit; Licensee Lifescience Global.

This is an open access article licensed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/>) which permits unrestricted, non-commercial use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the work is properly cited.